

MARICOPA COUNTY COMMISSION ON TRIAL COURT APPOINTMENTS

MINUTES

June 15, 2015

PRESENT: Justice Robert M. Brutinel, Acting Chair; Barry Aarons; Robert Dalager; Bill Hughes; Barbara Marshall; Walt Opaska; Steve Perica; Amanda Reeve; Ron Reinstein; Debra Stark

ABSENT: Leonard Gilroy; Donald Jarnagin; Tommy Richardson; Diane Rosztoczy; Don Vogel

Justice Robert Brutinel, Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m.

Introductions

Justice Brutinel introduced himself and noted a quorum of the Commission. He welcomed the Commission members and the public, and introduced new member Walt Opaska to the Commission.

He explained the purpose of the meeting is to interview for the positions created by the retirement of Judges Linda Miles, Robert Miles and Boyd Dunn.

Public Comment

Justice Brutinel asked for public comment on the candidates that will be interviewed for the Maricopa County vacancies. He reminded the speakers that they are limited to three minutes each and asked them not to repeat comments by previous speakers about the same candidate.

Michelle Carson spoke on behalf of Michael Anderson.

Carey Snyder Hyatt spoke on behalf of Ronee Steiner and Kerstin LeMaire.

Mark White spoke on behalf of Edith Lucero.

Lawrence Koplou spoke on behalf of Aryeh Schwartz.

Approval of Minutes

Justice Brutinel asked if any member wished to submit changes or additions to the draft minutes of the May 19, 2015 meeting. It was moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Interview Questions

A motion to go to executive session for the purpose of selecting interview questions was made at 8:42 a.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 9:18 a.m.

Due Diligence Reports

Commission members delivered the due diligence reports for all 15 candidates in order of the interview list.

Disqualifications and Disclosures

Justice Brutinel asked the Commission if there were additional disqualifications or disclosures since the screening meeting on May 19, 2015.

Barbara Marshall reminded the Commission that she is recused from voting on Michael Anderson.

Candidate Interviews

From 10:26 a.m. to 11:30 a.m. the Commission interviewed Michael Anderson, Aryeh Schwartz, Wendy Coy, Edith Lucero and Gregory Como.

The Commission recessed for lunch at 11:30 a.m.

Justice Brutinel called the meeting back to order at 12:40 p.m.

Candidate Interviews

From 12:44 p.m. to 1:36 p.m. the Commission interviewed Lisa Vandenberg, Stephen Hopkins, Ronee K. Steiner, Kerstin LeMaire, and Louis Seletos.

From 2:04 p.m. to 3:04 p.m. the Commission interviewed Joshua Rogers, Shellie Smith, Alison Bachus, Steven Lynch and Jeffrey Rueter.

Discussion of Applicants and Interviews and Selection of Nominees

Justice Brutinel reminded the Commission of the constitutionally required balance of political affiliations among nominees. He explained he would only vote on a candidate in the event of a tie.

A motion to go to executive session was made at 3:14 p.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The Commission returned to public session at 3:23 p.m.

The Commission discussed the interviews and the qualifications of the candidates in alphabetical order. Justice Brutinel suggested that a non-binding straw vote would be helpful to focus discussion and determine if any strong consensus existed on the potential nomination list. The results of the straw vote were:

Michael Anderson – 0
Alison Bachus – 6
Gregory Como – 8
Wendy Coy – 2
Stephen Hopkins – 9

Kerstin G. LeMaire – 8
Edith Lucero – 5
Steven Lynch – 6
Joshua Rogers – 6
Jeffrey Rueter – 8
Aryeh Schwartz – 4
Louis Seletos – 6
Shellie Smith – 5
Ronee K. Steiner – 4
Lisa VandenBerg – 8

After further discussion, the Commission agreed on a second straw vote on all candidates that received 3 or more votes. The results of the second straw vote were:

Alison Bachus – 6
Gregory Como – 7
Stephen Hopkins – 9
Kerstin G. LeMaire – 8
Edith Lucero – 5
Steven Lynch – 4
Joshua Rogers – 5
Jeffrey Rueter – 8
Aryeh Schwartz – 0
Louis Seletos – 5
Shellie Smith – 3
Ronee K. Steiner – 6
Lisa VandenBerg – 8

A motion to open the floor for individual nominations was made. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Justice Brutinel opened the floor for individual nominations to a non-binding list of nominees to be sent to the Governor.

Rob Dalager moved to add Shellie Smith to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Ron Reinstein moved to add Stephen Hopkins to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 9-0-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Alison Bachus to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Jeffrey Rueter to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 8-1-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Debra Stark moved to add Gregory Como to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Rob Dalager moved to add Ronee K. Steiner to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 7-2-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Edith Lucero to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Kerstin G. LeMaire to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 8-1-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Rob Dalager moved to add Steven Lynch to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Ron Reinstein moved to add Joshua Rogers to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 5-4-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Louis Seletos to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 6-3-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Lisa Vandenberg to the list. The motion was passed by a vote of 8-1-1 with Justice Brutinel abstaining.

Rob Dalager moved to close nominations. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

After further discussion it was moved that **Alison Bachus, Gregory Como, Stephen Hopkins, Kerstin G. LeMaire, Edith Lucero, Steven Lynch, Joshua Rogers, Jeffrey Rueter, Louis Seletos, Shellie Smith, Ronee K. Steiner and Lisa Vandenberg** be adopted as the final nomination list for submission to Governor Ducey. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Adjournment

Justice Brutinel thanked the members for their service. At 3:40 p.m., it was moved that the meeting be adjourned. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Rob Dalager
Commission Secretary