State of Arizona

COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Disposition of Complaint 18-125

Judge:

Complainant:

ORDER

The complainant alleged a superior court judge engaged in improper ex parte communications, failed to afford her an opportunity to be heard, and failed to appropriately supervise judicial staff.

The responsibility of the Commission on Judicial Conduct is to impartially determine if the judge engaged in conduct that violated the provisions of Article 6.1 of the Arizona Constitution or the Code of Judicial Conduct and, if so, to take appropriate disciplinary action. The purpose and authority of the commission is limited to this mission.

After review, the commission found no evidence of ethical misconduct and concluded that the judge did not violate the Code in this case. The commission approved sending the judge an advisory letter reminding her of the obligation to ensure all parties are given appropriate notice and an opportunity to be heard as required by Rule 2.6(A). The complaint is dismissed pursuant to Rules 16(b) and 23(a).

Commission members George H. Foster, Jr., Art Hinshaw and J. Tyrrell Taber did not participate in the consideration of this matter.

Dated: August 15, 2018

FOR THE COMMISSION

<u>/s/ Louis Frank Dominguez</u> Hon. Louis Frank Dominguez Commission Chair

Copies of this order were distributed to all appropriate persons on August 15, 2018.

This order may not be used as a basis for disqualification of a judge.

CONFIDENTIAL Arizona Commission on Judicial Conduct 1501 W. Washington Street, Suite 229 Phoenix, Arizona 85007 FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

18-125

COMPLAINT AGAINST A JUDGE

Name:

Judge's Name:

Instructions: Use this form or plain paper of the same size to file a complaint. Describe in your own words what you believe the judge did that constitutes judicial misconduct. Be specific and list all of the names, dates, times, and places that will help the commission understand your concerns. Additional pages may be attached along with copies (not originals) of relevant court documents. Please complete one side of the paper only, and keep a copy of the complaint for your records.

1. Judge

engaged in Exparte Communication with

on

B On or about on behalf of her client filed a Motion for Temporary Orders without Notice. The Court denied the Motion without notice and instead, the Court issued an order that the Motion without notice fails to demonstrate that immediate or irreparable harm will occur without the Court order and found insufficient cause to grant a motion without all parties given an "

" and issued an order to appear for at Noted specifically in the Order to Appear was that " and that the "

Must serve copies of the underlying Petition [or motion] and all related documents including this order, upon the Responding Party within of the hearing in accordance with Rules 40, 41, 42, and 91 Arizona Rules of Family Law Procedure. The Notice was never Served.

On or about the Court was advised the order to appear was never served. The Order to Appear issued by the Court for the return hearing was never served. Due Process was at issue for lack of service. The return hearing should have been vacated. never filed an Affidavit of Service since the order to appear and underlying documents were never served as the Court ordered. nonetheless went to the return hearing anyway and failed to advise the Court that the Motion for Temporary Orders and Order to Appear were never served, but instead the attorney and Judge had an extended Exparte communication all of which was on the record. (See transcript of return hearing and FTR of the return hearing of

conducted inappropriate and Judge return hearing, During the Never once did Judge exparte communications in the Court room from the period of inquire about whether there was effectuated service of process of the Order to appear. ask where I was nor had I received notice of the order to appear Never once did Judge before the hearing. Never once during the Exparte mandated to be served at least discuss that on and Communication in open Court between Judge advising her that she had not effectuated service of process and I had no I emailed plans to be present at court for a hearing that had not been properly noticed. Nonetheless exparte Juda knew communications ensured between Judge that the nature of the hearing was limited to the her Motion for Temporary Orders filed on and her Petition for Order to Show Cause Re: Contempt she filed on Yet engaged in elicited unilateral argument from exparte discussions about a pending motion. Then Judge regarding a pending Motion to Dismiss which was never subject of the hearing for for her as to how to conducted exparte inquiries of Judge non- appearance when she could have looked at the docket and known service of the Motion and Order to Appear had not effectuated. The Exparte discussions were violation of Cannons of Judicial Conduct.

CONFIDENTIAL

Arizona Commission on Judicial Conduct 1501 W. Washington Street, Suite 229 Phoenix, Arizona 85007

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

COMPLAINT AGAINST A JUDGE

Name:

Judge's Name:

Instructions: Use this form or plain paper of the same size to file a complaint. Describe in your own words what you believe the judge did that constitutes judicial misconduct. Be specific and list all of the names, dates, times, and places that will help the commission understand your concerns. Additional pages may be attached along with copies (not originals) of relevant court documents. Please complete one side of the paper only, and keep a copy of the complaint for your records.

hearing was on the docket as a return hearing for the Motion for Temporary Orders and The filed on behalf of Petition for Order to Show Cause Re: Violation of the Preliminary Injunction engaged in exparte discussions on a pending Motion and Judge her client. to Dismiss and my Motion to Extend time to file a Response. I was not there on any of the contested knew that the hearing were discussing. Judge and Judge issues was docketed as a return hearing Motion for Temporary Orders and Petition set for then asked for Order to Show Cause Re: Violation of the Preliminary Injunction. Judge during exparte discussions on the record for legal advise as to how to to the Motion to Dismiss and failing to appear on regarding

There was by the Court that the return hearing would deal with a pending Motion to Dismiss. The judge's conduct in discussing a pending motion to dismiss with an attorney during exparte discussions where other attorneys were present in the Courtroom and one of the litigants were present was wholly violative of the Cannons of Judicial Conduct. This conduct gives rise to little or no confidence that this judicial officer can dispense justice or fair decisions in that there is an appearance of manifest impropriety occurring in this courtroom.

This is not the first occasion of exparte communications I have experienced with this Judicial officer. Specifically, in the case of the adverse counsel had filed a motion to continue a hearing. Neither Judge nor her asked if i was going to file a response to the unilaterally continued a hearing on only having filed a motion.

Certainly. Judge

My

level of confidence as to this judicial officer has been dramatically reduced. An admonishment and requirement that a mentor judge sit in the Courtroom with her may be appropriate for this judicial officer.