## State of Arizona

## COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Disposition of Comp.	laints $20\hbox{-}288$ an	d 20-315
----------------------	---------------------------	----------

Judge:

Complainants:

## **ORDER**

The complainants alleged that a justice of the peace was verbally hostile and unprofessional in emails sent to other judicial officers as well as court staff. In addition, one complainant alleged that the justice of the peace displayed gender and racial bias against her and another justice of the peace.

Among other things, the Commission's investigation revealed severe discord amongst the justices of the peace, and concerns were raised about use of the Commission for improper purposes. For these reasons, the Commission has chosen to clarify its role in the judicial system.

The Commission is a regulatory body, whose role is to impartially determine if a judicial officer has engaged in conduct that violates the Arizona Code of Judicial Conduct or Article 6.1 of the Arizona Constitution. There must be clear and convincing evidence of such a violation in order for the Commission to take disciplinary action against a judicial officer.

The Commission is not a body that is meant to supervise, monitor, or otherwise engage in administrative duties over a judicial officer(s) or courthouses. Under Commission Rule 2, "The purpose of the commission is to administer the judicial discipline and incapacity system established by the constitution." Additionally, Commission Rule 5 states, "The purpose of the judicial discipline and incapacity system is to protect the public and to maintain high standards for the judiciary and the administration of justice. Any disciplinary remedy or sanction imposed shall be sufficient to restore and maintain the dignity and honor of the position and to protect the public by assuring that the judge will refrain from similar acts of misconduct in the future." The Commission is not intended to be a body which mediates interpersonal disputes or power struggles between duly-elected judicial officers.

The Commission investigates and decides complaints which are submitted to it. Discipline can only be administered upon a finding of clear and convincing evidence, not speculation, hearsay, or other such conjecture. This is an exacting standard only surpassed by the burden of proof required in criminal prosecutions.

After careful review and investigation of the complaints in this matter, the Commission found clear and convincing evidence that the judge had sent hostile, unprofessional, and undignified emails to other judicial officers, and in some instances, copied the entire staff of the court on the emails. While this was improper under Rules 1.2 and 2.8(B) of the Code of Judicial Conduct, the Scope Section of the Code provides that not every transgression will result in the imposition of discipline. The Commission decided, after considering all the facts and circumstances, to dismiss the Complaint pursuant to Commission Rules 16(b) and 23(a), but to issue a warning letter to the judicial officer reminding him to ensure that his communications with other judicial officers, especially when court staff is involved, should be professional, courteous, and dignified. To do less than that brings the judiciary into disrepute.

There was not clear and convincing evidence to support the remaining allegations of the complaint.

Commission members Roger D. Barton and Christopher P. Staring did not participate in the consideration of this matter.

Dated: November 12, 2021

FOR THE COMMISSION

/s/ Louis Frank Dominguez
Hon. Louis Frank Dominguez
Commission Chair

Copies of this order were distributed to all appropriate persons on November 12, 2021.

Comp

20-315

Sent: To: Cc:				
Subject:	RE: Judge			
This type of language f courthouse deserves re	rom espectful behavior from	udge is creating an its judges.	unsafe work environm	ent. Kindly stop it. This
From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: RE: Judge	Courtroom			
Judge				
I did not start the conve thought about that just	like she should have th	buildingJudge o	did, not my issue	should have
thatshould we now di	what did the scuss the	refer to with you??		Do you remember

## CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:

From:

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:
The contents of this email message and any attachments are intended solely for the addressee(s) and may contain confidential and/or privileged information and may be legally protected from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient of this message or their agent, or if this message has been addressed to you in error, please immediately alert the sender by reply email and then delete this message and any attachments. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, dissemination, copying, or storage of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited.

From:						
Sent:						
To:						
Cc:						
Subject: I	RE: Judge	:ourtr	oom			
Judge	can you pl	ease ren	nember that you are speakir	ng to the ent	ire building?	
"Before y	ou speak, think -	is it nec	essary? Is it true? Is it kind?	Will it hurt a	anyone? Will it improve on the sile	ence?"
From:						
Sent: F						
To:						
Cc:	Anna Barata					
Subject: R	e: Juage	Courtr	oom			
Great idea	aplease make s	ure to ir	ivite	so	can express her genuine feeling	s for Judge
at			this is my RSVP for that			
Sent from	my iPhone					
	y ii iioiic					
Oı	n				wrote:	
Go	ood reminder I b	elieve a	celebratio	n is in order		
Er	om:					
	nt:					
To						
Cc	:					
Su	<b>bject:</b> Re: Judge		Courtroom			
Go	ood to know Judg	Ze.	in reality, you have	to sche	dule anything for other judges,	
	raignment week		since you were	to serie	dute anything for other judges,	
Se	nt from my iPho	ne				
	0.5					
	On				wrote:	
	I refuse to Judge	schedul	e any in-person hearings for	r any judge d	uring this pandemic.	
	Sent from i	mv iPho	ne			
	OUT TO THE	,				

On wrote.

As of today, Judge will no longer be doing in-person hearings. All hearings will be done via zoom. If you have any questions please contact myself or

Thank you

Court

From: Sent: To: Cc:			
Subject:		RE: Judge	Courtroom
Thank you, Much apprecia		g me know that Judge	will be only conducting Zoom hearings starting
From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: RE: Jud	dge	Courtroom	
Good reminder	I believe a	celebra	ation is in order.
From: Sent: To: Cc: Subject: Re: Juc	dge	Courtroom	
Good to know J since yo	ludge	.in reality, you have	to schedule anything for other judges, Arraignment week
Sent from my iF	Phone		
On			wrote:
l refuse Judge	e to schedul	e any in-person hearings	for any judge during this pandemic.
Sent fro	om my iPhor	ne	
	On		wrote:
	As of today be done via	_	onger be doing in-person hearings. All hearings will uestions please contact myself or
	Thank you		

Court

THE COMMISSION'S POLICY IS TO POST ONLY THE FIRST FIVE PAGES OF ANY DISMISSED COMPLAINT ON ITS WEBSITE.

FOR ACCESS TO THE
REMAINDER OF THE
COMPLAINT IN THIS MATTER,
PLEASE MAKE YOUR REQUEST
IN WRITING TO THE
COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL
CONDUCT AND REFERENCE
THE COMMISSION CASE
NUMBER IN YOUR REQUEST.